



Submission to the UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women: Review of Canada at 89th Session (October 7-25, 2024)

September 2024

HIV Legal Network www.hivlegalnetwork.ca

Canadian Drug Policy Coalition <u>www.drugpolicy.ca</u>

INTRODUCTION

- 1. The HIV Legal Network (Legal Network) and the Canadian Drug Policy Coalition (CDPC) make this submission to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW Committee) in advance of its review of the periodic report of Canada, held during its 89th Session (October 7-25, 2024).
- 2. The Legal Network is a health justice organization that works to promote the human rights of people living with HIV or AIDS and other populations disproportionately affected by HIV, punitive laws and policies, and criminalization, in Canada and internationally.
- 3. CDPC is a national, non-partisan organization working to advance drug policy grounded in evidence, public health and human rights in Canada.
- 4. In this submission, we wish to highlight priority concerns regarding inadequate implementation of the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women* (CEDAW) for women and gender minorities who use drugs. We are particularly concerned with insufficient protections against gender-based violence (GBV), as well as other violations of the human rights to health, safety, and protection from discrimination (notably Articles 2, 3, and 12 of CEDAW) for women and gender minorities who experience multiple, intersecting forms of oppression.

BACKGROUND

- 5. The Canadian government has acknowledged the need to implement enhanced health and safety initiatives for women, girls and gender-diverse people, who historically and contemporaneously experience elevated rates of ill health and unmet safety needs. To this end, Canada has made some advancements in how it conceptualizes and addresses health and safety for people who are marginalized at the intersections of their socioeconomic background, race, ethnicity, cultural background, and/or ability. However, women and gender minorities who use illegal drugs, and who are involved in the illegal drug trade, continue to experience extreme discrimination compounded for women and gender minorities who status, and ability.
- 6. Women and gender minorities who use illegal drugs have been systematically dehumanized by well over a century of criminal-legal responses to drug use and the cultural attitudes that flow from these responses so much so that they are routinely excluded from basic conceptions of personhood. For example, the belief that women and gender minorities who use drugs lack rationality and self-control manifests in discriminatory housing, shelter, employment, and child apprehension policies. It is still taken for granted that caregivers who use drugs are automatically a risk to themselves and their children. Because drug-related stigma is naturalized in nearly every domain of social activity, it has been rendered invisible.

Our primary purpose with this submission is to illuminate how the human rights of women and gender minorities who use drugs remain obscured, deprioritized, or overlooked by the Canadian government even as its understanding of gender-based health and safety is evolving.

WORKING DEFINITIONS OF HEALTH AND SAFETY

- 7. "Health" is characterized by more than the mere absence of physical illness, disease, or disablement. It is a multi-faceted state of mental, emotional, physical, and communal wellbeing. Health outcomes are also shaped by socio-cultural, political, and economic factors through complex causal pathways. Therefore, we adopt a broad and holistic definition of health that encompasses multiple outcome measures, and will describe how specific policies, programs, practices, laws, and regulations at every level of Canadian government preclude women and gender minorities who use drugs from access to the very conditions required to pursue health. We do so to incorporate considerations of how legislative and regulatory environments promote or undermine health for individuals and communities.
- 8. Similarly, we view "safety" as more than the absence of mental, emotional, and bodily harm or the threat of harm. A robust and comprehensive definition of safety denotes objective and perceived security in every domain of social activity. To be "safe" is to trust that one can meet their material needs for food, shelter, and other requirements for sustaining life; can readily access a range of interpersonal supports to improve their objective and perceived security; can seek meaningful recourse when they experience mental, emotional, and bodily harm or the threat of harm; and can enjoy the benefits of full civic, economic, and political participation. One's experience of safety is therefore heavily contingent on the legislative and regulatory environments, and the presence of policies, programs, practices, laws, and regulations designed to promote objective and perceived security. With this submission, we discuss how women and gender minorities are routinely excluded from accessing the conditions required to pursue health and safety.

WOMEN WHO USE DRUGS AND GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE

In the CEDAW Committee's LOI, the Committee asked of Canada:

12. ... Please provide information on the implementation of the strategy to combat genderbased violence, including its main objectives, the financial and human resources allocated for its implementation and whether a monitoring mechanism will be put into place.

9. Violence against women (VAW) is among the "most pervasive health risks to women and gender-diverse people" in Canada,¹ and since 2019, the country has seen increasing rates of femicides² — borne disproportionately by certain populations, including women who use

¹ House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women, *Towards a Violence-Free Canada: Addressing and Eliminating Intimate Partner and Family Violence*, Report of the Standing Committee, June 2022 at p. 20.

² Statistics Canada, *Number of victims of spousal homicide*, July 2023; D. Sutton, *Gender-related homicide of women and girls in Canada*, Statistics Canada, 5 April 2023, at p. 3; and Canadian Femicide Observatory for Justice and Accountability, *#CallitFemicide: Understanding sex/gender-related killings of women and girls in Canada, 2018-2022*, April 2023.

drugs³ and Indigenous women.⁴ This is in the context of an unprecedented overdose crisis in Canada that has claimed almost 45,000 lives since 2016,⁵ with Indigenous women particularly affected.⁶

- 10. Despite increasing recognition of the need to provide shelter and supports to women who use drugs,⁷ several provinces continue to mandate zero-tolerance among their shelters or link drug use to dangerous behaviour.⁸ As a result, women are often barred from admission if they are noticeably intoxicated or are forced to leave for having or using drugs.⁹ A 2021 national survey found that, among 500 women and gender diverse people, those who used drugs were barred from shelters at a rate that was three times higher than those who did not.¹⁰
- 11. Unsurprisingly, most shelters do not meet the needs of women who use drugs.¹¹ In a survey of 203 low-barrier women's shelters, 79% of shelters reported that it was a "major challenge" to serve women who use drugs.¹² Consequently, women are dying in shelters.¹³
- 12. Similarly, there remains inadequate access to supervised consumption services (SCS) in Canada particularly gender-sensitive and culturally appropriate SCS.¹⁴ SCS provide a safe, hygienic environment where people can use drugs with sterile equipment under the supervision of trained staff or volunteers to prevent HIV and hepatitis C (HCV) transmission and overdose deaths and have been one key measure to address Canada's ongoing unregulated drug crisis. SCS can also provide a refuge from various forms of violence that women may experience on the street¹⁵ and have been found to disrupt certain social structures such as gender power dynamics, enabling women to assert agency over their drug use practices.¹⁶

³ See, e.g., E. Moir, "Hidden GBV: Women and substance use," *Frontiers Psychiatry* 13 (2022); A. Hovey and S. Scott, "All Women Are Welcome: Reducing Barriers to Women's Shelters With Harm Reduction," *Partner Abuse* 10(4) (2019): 409-428; and A. Hovey, "Understanding the Landscape of Substance Use Management Practices in Domestic Violence Shelters across Ontario," *Journal of Family Violence*, 35(2) (2019): 191-201.

⁴ See, e.g., Government of Canada, Key statistics on gender-based violence in Canada, 10 June 2024.

⁵ Government of Canada, Opioid- and Stimulant-related Harms in Canada, June 28, 2024.

⁶ First Nations Health Authority, "First Nations Illicit Drug Deaths Rise during COVID-19 Pandemic, July 6, 2020 and CBC Radio Canada, "Les Premières Nations particulièrement touchées par les surdoses aux opioids," December 3, 2019.

⁷ See, e.g., K. Maki, *More Than a Bed: A National Profile of VAW Shelters and Transition Houses*, Women's Shelters Canada, May 2019 and A. Boulanger et al, *Towards Access for All: Best and Promising Practices from Low-Barrier Harm Reduction Shelters in Canada*, HIV Legal Network, 20 February 2024.

⁸ A. Boulanger et al., ibid.

⁹ K. Maki, supra, at p. 34.

¹⁰ K. Schwan et al., *The Pan-Canadian Women's Housing & Homelessness Survey,* Canadian Observatory of Homelessness, 2021.

¹¹ A. Hovey and S. Scott, supra at p. 409.

¹² K. Maki, supra.

¹³ See, e.g., Government of Yukon, *Government of Yukon implementing coroner's inquest recommendations*, 12 July 2024 and Ontario Drug Policy Research Network, *Opioid-Related Toxicity Deaths Within Ontario Shelters: Circumstances of Death and Priori Medication & Healthcare Use*, June 2024.

¹⁴ Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network, *Gendering the Scene: Women, Gender-Diverse People, and Harm Reduction in Canada*, 2020.

¹⁵ N. Fairbairn, "Seeking refuge from violence in street-based drug scenes: Women's experiences in North America's first supervised injection facility," *Social Science & Medicine* 67 (2008): 817–823.

¹⁶ J. Boyd, "Gendered violence & overdose prevention sites: A rapid ethnographic study during an overdose epidemic in Vancouver, Canada," *Addiction*, September 2018, DOI: 10.1111/add.14417.

- 13. In particular, gender-specific SCS can connect women who use drugs to resources including women's shelters and programming for domestic and sexual violence prevention.
- 14. There are two SCS sites in Canada offering gender-specific services for women, and such services should be made more widely available. Women who rely on intimate partners for assisted injection are at greater risk of intimate partner violence.¹⁷ Young women who inject drugs in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside are 54 times more likely to die prematurely, often by violence, compared to people in Canada who do not inject drugs, and at least 4 times more likely to die prematurely than young men who inject drugs from the same region.¹⁸
- 15. A major barrier to accessing both shelter and SCS for women who use drugs is the criminalization of people who use drugs, which fuels stigma towards drug use and prevents women from seeking or obtaining protection. Blanket bans on substance use in shelters are justified on discriminatory and unfounded beliefs that people who use drugs are inherently dangerous to shelter staff, other shelter participants, and children, or on the perceived need to minimize criminal liability for permitting prohibited drugs on site.¹⁹ Criminalization also hinders the scale-up of SCS while deterring people from vital health services and forcing people who use drugs to acquire drugs from an unregulated market.
- 16. Following her 2018 visit to Canada, the Special Rapporteur on VAW called on Canada to establish an adequate number of, and sustainably fund, shelters and services for women fleeing violence, considering the needs of women belonging to vulnerable groups. At the time, there were 553 VAW shelters, which the Special Rapporteur concluded was insufficient. The Special Rapporteur also called on Canada to ensure that women are not criminalized when they seek protection.²⁰ As of 2020-2021, there are only 557 shelters, with hundreds of people turned away from shelters each day, and about three in ten returning to the home in which their abuser lives.²¹
- 17. Failing to provide shelter and SCS to women who use drugs represents a clear violation of the Convention. During its 2016 review of Canada, the CEDAW Committee expressed its concern with "the significant legislative and administrative barriers women face to access supervised consumption services" and recommended that Canada "reduce the gap in health service delivery related to women's drug use, by scaling-up and ensuring access to culturally appropriate harm reduction services."²² Moreover, the CEDAW Committee has previously concluded that States Parties had breached their Convention obligations because they did not have sufficiently accessible VAW shelters,²³ including for women who use drugs.²⁴

¹⁷ Canadian Research Initiative in Substance Misuse (CRISM), *National Operational Guidance for the Implementation of Supervised Consumption Services*, July 17, 2023.

¹⁸ C. L. Miller et al., "Factors associated with premature mortality among young injection drug users in Vancouver." *Harm Reduct J.* 2007 Jan 4;4:1. doi: 10.1186/1477-7517-4-1.

¹⁹ A. Boulanger et al., supra.

²⁰ Visit to Canada: Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences, 4 November 2019, A/HRC/41/42/Add.1, at para. 95(j).

²¹ D. Ibrahim, *Canadian residential facilities for victims of abuse,* 2020/2021, Statistics Canada, 12 April 2022.

²² CEDAW Committee Canada, supra.

²³ CEDAW Committee, *Report of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women*, 18 March 2005, A/60/38, at pp. 27-39.

²⁴ CEDAW Committee, Concluding observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, 31 October 2022, CEDAW/C/ UKR/CO/9, para. 30(e).

CANADA MUST:

- Increase funding to all shelters for women fleeing violence;
- Ensure that women are not barred from shelters on the basis of drug use;
- Reduce the gaps in health service delivery related to drug use by funding, scalingup, and ensuring access to gender-sensitive and culturally appropriate harm reduction services, including supervised consumption services, and services in shelters;
- Decriminalize the possession of all drugs for personal use and the sharing or selling of drugs for subsistence, to support personal drug use costs, or to provide a safer supply and ensuring the meaningful involvement of people who use drugs.

PROGRAMMES TO COMBAT HIV AND OTHER SEXUALLY TRANSMITTED INFECTIONS

In the LOI, the CEDAW Committee asked of Canada:

22. ... Please also indicate whether a gender perspective has been integrated into the existing programmes to combat HIV and other sexually transmitted infections.

- 18. Women and gender minorities who use drugs experience poorer health outcomes compared to other women and to men who use drugs. One clear indicator of poorer health outcomes and the need for expanded gender-specific programming is the disproportionately high rates of HIV transmission among women who inject drugs.
- 19. In 2022, there were 1,833 new HIV diagnoses in Canada, a 24.9% annual increase compared to 2021.²⁵ Among women, 36.1% of new HIV diagnoses were linked to injection drug use.²⁶ Comparatively, among men, 13.1% of new HIV diagnoses were linked to injection drug use and 4.9% were linked to male-to-male sexual contact combined with injection drug use.²⁷ Women who inject drugs are also starkly overrepresented among women who are newly diagnosed with HIV at the regional level in Canada. For example, in 2021, the province of Manitoba was the only Canadian province that did not meet any of the previous UNAIDS 90-90 treatment targets.²⁸ From 2018 to 2021, 44.8% of new HIV diagnoses in Manitoba were

²⁵ Public Health Agency of Canada. *HIV in Canada: 2022 surveillance highlights*. Online: <u>https://www.canada.ca/en/public-health/services/publications/diseases-conditions/hiv-2022-surveillance-highlights.html</u>

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ A. Sharp et al., "Sex differences in houselessness, injection drug use, and mental health conditions among people newly diagnosed with HIV in Manitoba, Canada from 2018 to 2021: a retrospective cohort study." *The Lancet Regional Health – Americas*. August 2024: 36, 100805.

among women; a higher proportion than the national rate of 30%.²⁹ 71.8% of women newly diagnosed with HIV in Manitoba reported injection drug use.³⁰ Across the country, new clusters of HIV diagnoses are being driven by women who inject drugs who also have a high overlapping burden of homelessness and mental health conditions.³¹

- 20. There are also significant regional disparities in health outcomes among women and gender minorities who use drugs in Canada. For instance, rates of virologic suppression among HIV-positive people are lower in rural areas compared to major urban centres.³² These disparities are linked to inequities in access to healthcare and harm reduction services, including sterile drug use equipment and supervised consumption services (SCS), for people in remote, rural, and northern communities. Urban settings tend to have greater access to harm reduction services because geographic distance, lack of transportation, a shortage of trained healthcare providers, and lack of anonymity act as barriers for people living outside of them. There are also longer wait times in rural regions for referrals to care.
- 21. High rates of HIV, as well as poorer clinical outcomes after diagnosis, among women who use drugs can be traced to policy and legislative environments that penalize drug use. First, enforcement-based approaches to drug control are associated with increased risk behaviours. For instance, women who use drugs report frequent harassment and confiscation of drug equipment by police,³³ which in turn fuels rushed and unsanitary injections and equipment sharing.³⁴ Simultaneously, drug-related stigma is associated with decreased progression through the cascade of evidence-based HIV care. A culture of fear and mistrust of police, social service workers, and medical personnel amongst women who use drugs leads to low uptake of health and social services. Women report that experiences of sexism often intersect with other forms of discrimination to create significant barriers to accessing HIV treatment.³⁵
- 22. Rates of HIV and other infections are particularly pronounced among women who require assistance with drug injection. Women who inject drugs are more than twice as likely to require assistance with injection compared to men.³⁶ Among women who require assistance, they are approximately twice as likely to contract HIV compared to women who do not require assistance.³⁷ This is because those who provide assistance with injecting often use the same

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Y. Zhao et al., "Precarious Housing Associated with Unsuppressed Viral load, sub-optimal Access to HIV Treatment and Unmet Health care Needs, Among Women Living with HIV in Metro Vancouver, Canada," *AIDS Behav* 27, 2271–2284 (2023). https://doi.org/10.1007/s10461-022-03957-2.

 ³² See, e.g., D. Jaworsky et al., "Comparative Outcomes and Service Utilization Trends (COAST) Study. Influence of the definition of rurality on geographic differences in HIV outcomes in British Columbia: a retrospective cohort analysis," *CMAJ Open.* 2020 Oct 19;8(4):E643-E650. doi: 10.9778/cmajo.20200066 and K.R. Schafer et al., "The Continuum of HIV Care in Rural Communities in the United States and Canada: What Is Known and Future Research Directions," *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr.* 2017 May 1;75(1):35-44. doi: 10.1097/QAI.000000000001329.
³³ H. Cooper et al., "Characterizing perceived police violence: implications for public health," *Am J Public Health.* 2004 Jul;94(7):1109-18. doi: 10.2105/ajph.94.7.1109.

³⁴ K. Shannon et al., "Mapping violence and policing as an environmental–structural barrier to health service and syringe availability among substance-using women in street-level sex work," *International Journal of Drug Policy*, Volume 19, Issue 2, 2008, 140-147, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugpo.2007.11.024.

 ³⁵ M.E. Pearce et al. "Women in the 2019 hepatitis C cascade of care: findings from the British Columbia Hepatitis Testers cohort study," *BMC Womens Health.* 2021 Sep 13;21(1):330. doi: 10.1186/s12905-021-01470-7.
³⁶ W. Small et al., "The Injection Support Team: A Peer-Driven Program to Address Unsafe Injecting in a Canadian Setting," *Substance Use & Misuse*, *47*(5), 491–501. 2012. https://doi.org/10.3109/10826084.2012.644107
³⁷ J.M. O'Connell et al., "Requiring help injecting independently predicts incident HIV infection among injection drug users," *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr.* 2005 Sep 1;40(1):83-8. doi: 10.1097/01.qai.0000157006.28535.ml.

syringe between two individuals.³⁸ Women who cannot self-administer injections commonly report consuming drugs via injection equipment that has already been used,³⁹ some of which may be attributed to gendered power dynamics within heterosexual partnerships.⁴⁰

Sterile Drug Use Equipment Distribution, Supervised Consumption Services, and Decriminalization

- 23. Higher rates of new HIV diagnoses due to injection drug use among women point to a need for greater access to sterile drug use equipment, SCS, assisted injection services, and harm reduction programs for women and girls who use drugs.
- 24. With respect to sterile drug use equipment, the provinces and territories, which are responsible for healthcare service delivery, do not provide equal or consistent access. The Saskatchewan government has withdrawn its funding and support for sterile smoking equipment and introduced excessive limitations on distribution of sterile injection supplies.⁴¹ These policy changes create significant barriers to accessing sterile equipment. Yet, lack of access to sterile smoking equipment in Saskatchewan has led to increases in injection drug use, which pose greater risk of HIV transmission.⁴² Significantly restricted or eliminated access to sterile drug use equipment, results in a greater likelihood of transmission of bloodborne infections. Notably, Saskatchewan has the highest rate of new HIV diagnoses in Canada at 19 per 100.000 population, more than four times the national rate.⁴³ Other provinces and territories also have inconsistent access to harm reduction equipment, leading to harms which are exacerbated for women who use drugs. The Ontario government has indicated its intention to prohibit sterile drug use equipment at provincially funded "health hubs."⁴⁴ In B.C., the Premier has ordered a review of a harm reduction program that dispenses free sterile equipment,⁴⁵ eliciting grave concerns such programs may be cancelled or rolled back.
- 25. As discussed, SCS are low-barrier facilities where people can receive sterile drug use equipment, consume pre-obtained drugs, and receive lifesaving emergency response in case of drug poisoning or overdose. In most cases, SCS require approval via a formal exemption under the federal Controlled Drugs and Substances Act allowing people to consume criminalized substances in a site without threat of criminal prosecution,⁴⁶ although healthcare is administered at the provincial/territorial level.
- 26. SCS that allow for assisted injection are particularly important for HIV and STI prevention

³⁸ J.S. Pedersen et al., "Declining trends in the rates of assisted injecting; a prospective cohort study," Harm Reduct J 13, 2 (2016). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12954-016-0092-3

³⁹ E. Tuchman, "Women's injection drug practices in their own words: a qualitative study," Harm Reduct J 12, 6 (2015). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12954-015-0041-6 ⁴⁰ J.S. Pedersen et al., supra.

⁴¹ See J. Lynn, "Saskatchewan restricts needle exchange, makes changes to harm reduction funding." CTV News, Jan 18, 2024 and A. Quon, A. "Experts condemn Sask.'s move to stop providing pipes, limit needle exchanges." CBC News, Jan 18, 2024.

⁴² A. Lekhtman, "Saskatchewan's "Pipe Prohibition" Sees Rise in Riskier Drug Use," *Filter Mag.* June 25, 2024. ⁴³ Public Health Agency of Canada, supra.

⁴⁴ Ontario Ministry of Health. "Ontario Protecting Communities and Supporting Addiction Recovery with New Treatment Hubs." Online: https://news.ontario.ca/en/release/1004955/ontario-protecting-communities-and-supportingaddiction-recovery-with-new-treatment-hubs. ⁴⁵ C. Palmer, "B.C. to review harm reduction vending machines at 3 hospitals," *CBC News,* August 30, 2024.

⁴⁶ Note: the federal government has passed a bill that will introduce a regularization scheme for SCS approvals. which is forthcoming.

among women. Although 29 of 39 federally approved SCS allow for peer-assisted injection, these sites do not authorize assisted injection by a healthcare provider.⁴⁷ Assisted injection by peers and healthcare providers are a form of gender-sensitive harm reduction programming that could reduce the risk of HIV among women who inject drugs and should be expanded in SCS. Low-barrier distribution of sterile injection equipment, along with peer-based education on safer use practices, must be expanded to minimize the risk of infection transmission.

- 27. There are four decades of well-established evidence demonstrating the benefits of harm reduction services, including reduced rates of HIV transmission and other bloodborne infections.⁴⁸ A recent resolution passed at the 67th UN Commission on Narcotic Drugs directed member states to pursue harm reduction measures,⁴⁹ while the UN Global AIDS Strategy 2021-2026 identified scaling up harm reduction and needle distribution programs and removing any associated legal, regulatory or financial barriers as a key priority area.⁵⁰ Additionally, as noted above, the CEDAW Committee has previously expressed its concern with "the significant legislative and administrative barriers women face to access supervised consumption services" and recommended that Canada "reduce the gap in health service delivery related to women's drug use, by scaling-up and ensuring access to culturally appropriate harm reduction services."⁵¹ The Government of Canada's own Sexually Transmitted and Blood-Borne Infections (STBBI) Action Plan 2024-2031 indicates that access to sterile drug use equipment is critical to STBBI prevention and has committed the federal government to investing in community-based harm reduction programs and supporting the establishment of SCS.⁵²
- 28. Despite this, political leaders in Canada have increasingly spread misinformation and harmful claims about harm reduction programs and services. For example, the current leader of the federal opposition has described SCS as "drug dens" and vowed to shut down these essential services if he forms government in 2025.⁵³ Ontario's premier has described SCS as "the worst thing that could ever happen to a community".⁵⁴
- 29. Decriminalization of drug use and possession would also help support safer drug use practices, access to harm reduction programs, HIV prevention, and reduction of overdose among women who use drugs. Canada's STBBI Action Plan 2024-2031 commits the federal government to divert individuals away from the criminal justice system for drug possession

⁴⁷ Government of Canada, "Supervised consumption sites: Status of applications," Online: <u>https://www.canada.ca/en/health-canada/services/substance-use/supervised-consumption-sites/status-</u> application.html.

 ⁴⁸ E. Armbrecht et al., "Supervised Injection Facilities and Other Supervised Consumption Sites: Effectiveness and Value; Final Evidence Report." *Institute for Clinical and Economic Review*, January 8, 2021.

⁴⁹ Commission on Narcotic Drugs. "Unedited revised E/CN.7/2024/L.5/Rev.2" *Implementation of the international drug control treaties: other matters arising from the international drug control treaties.* 22 March 2024.

⁵⁰ UNAIDS. Global AIDS Strategy 2021-2026. March 2021.

⁵¹ CEDAW Committee Canada, supra.

⁵² Government of Canada. *Government of Canada's Sexually Transmitted and Blood-Borne Infections (STBBI) Action Plan 2024-2030.* 2024. Online: <u>https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/phac-</u>

aspc/documents/services/publications/diseases-conditions/sexually-transmitted-blood-borne-infections-action-plan-2024-2030/government-of-canada-stbbi-action-plan-final-en.pdf

⁵³ Canadian Press. "Pierre Poilievre calls supervised consumption sites 'drug dens'." *CBC News*.

https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/supervised-consumption-site-scale-back-poilievre-1.7262063 ⁵⁴ A. Talbot, "Doug Ford calls federal government the 'biggest drug dealer' in Canada for providing addicts with safer drug supplies." *CityNews*. https://toronto.citynews.ca/2024/08/21/doug-ford-calls-federal-government-the-biggest-drug-dealer-in-canada-for-providing-addicts-with-safer-drug-supplies/

charges through alternatives to prosecution,⁵⁵ while a 2021 Federal Expert Task Force on Substance Use recommended decriminalizing simple drug possession.⁵⁶

30. Despite this, simple drug possession remains a crime in Canada, deterring women who use drugs (including those who are primary caregivers for children) from utilizing SCS and other health services.⁵⁷ The criminalization of drugs, discriminatory surveillance of people who use or are perceived to be using drugs, and a deterministic conflation of parental drug use with child abuse and neglect have resulted in real or possible perceived loss of child custody or family reunification.⁵⁸ SCS and other harm reduction services can function as a site of surveillance for mothers who use drugs, whereby access to these services can create a greater risk for child apprehension, particularly for mothers who are poor, racialized, and gender diverse.⁵⁹ Further, the pain, grief and trauma of experiencing child apprehension can cause women to initiate or intensify drug use or engage in unsafe drug use practices such as injecting alone or rushing injections.⁶⁰ All of these factors increase risk of overdose and other drug-related harms.

As one part of a wider strategy to address the unmet health and safety needs among women who use drugs, CANADA MUST:

- Expand access consistently throughout the country to harm reduction programs including supervised consumption services and sterile drug use equipment distribution programs designed to account for the specific needs of women and gender minorities;
- Implement nationwide drug decriminalization.

⁵⁵ Government of Canada, supra.

 ⁵⁶ Health Canada Expert Task Force on Substance Use. *Report #2 Recommendations on the Federal Government's Drug Policy as Articulated in a Draft Canadian Drugs and Substances Strategy (CDSS).* June 11, 2021.
⁵⁷ J. Boyd et al., "Mothers Who Use Drugs: Closing the Gaps in Harm Reduction Response Amidst the Dual Epidemics of Overdose and Violence in a Canadian Urban Setting", *American Journal of Public Health* 112, no. S2. April 1, 2022. 191-S198. <u>https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2022.306776</u>

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ Ibid. ⁶⁰ Ibid.

DISADVANTAGED GROUPS OF WOMEN

In the CEDAW Committee's "List of issues and questions prior to the submission of the tenth periodic report of Canada," the Committee asked of Canada:

22. ... Please indicate the HIV infection rate among women and girls.... Please also indicate whether a gender perspective has been integrated into the existing programmes to combat HIV and other sexually transmitted infections.

23. Please provide updated information and data on the human rights situation of women facing intersectional discrimination, including women and girls with disabilities, Canadian women and girls of African descent, indigenous, migrant, refugee, asylum-seeking, lesbian, bisexual and transgender women and girls and intersex persons.... Please provide information on the situation and conditions of women in detention, in particular indigenous women.

- 31. The ongoing impacts of colonialism and a legacy of racist criminal law and law enforcement practices has resulted in the mass incarceration of Indigenous, Black, and other racialized communities in Canada.⁶¹ In particular, Indigenous and Black women are disproportionately affected. Indigenous women account for about half of all women in federal prisons (where people serve sentences of 2+ years), while representing roughly 4% of Canada's adult female population,⁶² and Black women account for (on average) 6% of all women in federal prisons, while representing approximately 3% of Canada's female adult population.⁶³ This overrepresentation is also mirrored in provincial and territorial prisons.⁶⁴
- 32. In recent decades, there has also been a substantial increase in the proportion of women who are federally incarcerated for a drug offence. Whereas only 16% of federally incarcerated women were serving sentences for drug offences in 1981,⁶⁵ this increased to 28% in 2021-2022; in comparison, 14% of federally incarcerated men in 2021-2022 were serving sentences for drug offences.⁶⁶ As the Correctional Investigator (Canada's ombudsperson for federal prisons) has noted, federally sentenced women are twice as likely to be serving a sentence for drug-related offences as their male counterparts, while Black women are more likely than white women to be in prison for that reason.⁶⁷ Acknowledging

⁶¹ See, e.g., A. Owusu-Bempah et al., "Race and Incarceration: The Representation and Characteristics of Black People in Provincial Correctional Facilities in Ontario, Canada," *Race and Justice* 13(4) (2023): 530-542; Justice Canada, *Overrepresentation of Indigenous People in the Canadian Criminal Justice System: Causes and Responses*, January 20, 2023.

 ⁶² Statistics Canada, "Indigenous population continues to grow and is much younger than the non-Indigenous population, although the pace of growth has slowed," *The Daily*, September 21, 2022.
⁶³ Department of Justice Canada, *Overrepresentation of Black people in the Canadian criminal justice system*,

 ⁶³ Department of Justice Canada, Overrepresentation of Black people in the Canadian criminal justice system,
December 2022 and Office of the Correctional Investigator, Annual Report 2021-2022, 2022.
⁶⁴ Ibid.

⁶⁵ R. Gobeil, *Profile of Federally Sentenced Women Drug Offenders*, Correctional Service of Canada, May 2009.

⁶⁶ Public Safety Canada, Corrections and Conditional Release Statistical Overview 2022, March 2024.

⁶⁷ Annual Report 2014-2015, supra. See also Office of the Correctional Investigator of Canada, Annual Report 2016-2017, 2017.

this troubling reality, the CEDAW Committee has previously expressed its concern with the "excessive use of incarceration as a drug-control measure against women.⁶⁸

- 33. Significant numbers of prisoners also use drugs. In a national survey conducted by the federal correctional service (Correctional Service Canada), 34% of men and 25% of women reported using non-injection drugs during the past six months in prison, while 17% of men and 14% of women reported injecting drugs.⁶⁹ Other studies have revealed high rates of syringe-sharing among people who use drugs in Canada's prisons, due to the lack of sterile injection equipment in prisons.⁷⁰ An increasing number of people in prison are also dying from preventable overdoses.⁷¹
- 34. Unsurprisingly, research shows that the incarceration of people who inject drugs is a factor driving Canada's HIV and HCV epidemics.⁷² In prison, the risk of STBBI transmission increases, as people are barred from necessary health and harm reduction services, leading to higher rates of HIV and HCV in prison compared to the broader community. A 2016 study indicated that about 30% of women (compared to 15% of men) in provincial prisons are living with HCV, and 1–9% of women (compared to 1–2% of men) are living with HIV.⁷³ Similarly, a larger proportion of women than men in federal prisons are living with HIV and HCV,⁷⁴ with highest reported prevalence amongst federally incarcerated Indigenous women.⁷⁵
- 35. Despite this, Canada does not provide prisoners with access to key harm reduction measures,⁷⁶ violating their rights to health, equality, and non-discrimination. As the UN Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners (Nelson Mandela Rules) and the UN Rules for the Treatment of Women Prisoners and Non-custodial Measures for Women Offenders recommend, incarcerated women must enjoy the same standards of healthcare that are available in the community,⁷⁷ including access to gender-specific healthcare.⁷⁸ This

⁶⁸ CEDAW Committee, *Concluding observations on the combined eighth and ninth periodic reports of Canada*, CEDAW/C/CAN/CO/8-9, 18 November 2016.

⁶⁹ D. Zakaria et al., *Summary of emerging findings from the 2007 National Inmate Infectious Diseases and Risk-Behaviours Survey*, Correctional Service of Canada, 2010.

⁷⁰ See, e.g., HIV Legal Network, *Points of Perspective: Research Report on the Federal Prison Needle Exchange Program in Canada*, 2022 and E. van der Meulen, "'It Goes on Everywhere': Injection Drug Use in Canadian Federal Prisons," *Substance Use & Misuse* 52, 7 (2017): 884–891.

⁷¹ See, for example, Tracking Injustice, online: <u>https://trackinginjustice.ca/findings-and-analysis-deaths-in-custody/;</u> L. McKendy et al., "Understanding overdose incidents in Canadian federal custody," *International Journal of Drug Policy* 92 (2021); A. Butler et al., "Burden of opioid toxicity death in the fentanyl-dominant era for people who experience incarceration in Ontario, Canada, 2015-2020: a whole population retrospective cohort study," *BMJ Open* 13(5) (2023); and L. Button et al., "Opioid-related deaths in Ontario correctional facilities and penitentiaries (2009-2019)," *Forensic Sci Med Pathol* 19(3) (2023): 357-363.

⁷² See, e.g., M.W. Tyndall et al., "Intensive injection cocaine use as the primary risk factor in the Vancouver HIV–1 epidemic," *AIDS* 17,6 (2003): 887–893; and H. Hagan, "The relevance of attributable risk measures to HIV prevention planning," *AIDS* 17,6 (2003): 911–913.

⁷³ F. Kouyoumdjian et al, "Health status of prisoners in Canada: Narrative review," *Canadian Family Physician* 62:3 (March 2016): 215-222.

 ⁷⁴ Correctional Service Canada, Prevalence rates of infectious diseases among offenders in federal custody, 2023.
⁷⁵ D. Zakaria et al., supra.

⁷⁶ R. Lines, "From equivalence of standards to equivalence of objectives: The entitlement of prisoners to healthcare standards higher than those outside prisons," *International Journal for Prisoner Health* 2(4) (2006): 269-280.

⁷⁷ Rule 24 of the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners, UN Doc. A/RES/70/175, December 17, 2015.

⁷⁸ Rule 10 of *United Nations Rules for the Treatment of Women Prisoners and Non-custodial Measures for Women Offenders*, UN Doc. A/RES/65/229, March 16, 2011.

includes key interventions recommended by the UNODC, UNAIDS, and WHO such as sterile needle and syringe programs, safer sex supplies, programs to address tattooing, piercing and other forms of skin penetration, HIV treatment, care and support, and opioid agonist therapy (OAT).⁷⁹ During its 2016 review of Canada, the CEDAW Committee expressed its concern with "high rates of HIV/AIDS among female inmates" and recommended that Canada "expand care, treatment, and support services to women in detention living with or vulnerable to HIV/AIDS, including by implementing prison-based needle and syringe programmes, opioid substitution therapy, condoms and other safer sex supplies."⁸⁰

- 36. With respect to OAT, WHO guidelines state that OAT should be available to people in prison and equivalent to community options.⁸¹ While access to OAT has improved in some Canadian jurisdictions, federal and provincial prisoners continue to experience significant barriers. Several provincial and territorial prisons still do not offer OAT or impose severe restrictions on access, resulting in acute withdrawal among prisoners and an increased risk of overdose.⁸² Among those jurisdictions that do initiate OAT, long waitlists and inappropriate medication terminations persist.⁸³
- 37. Access to sterile drug equipment in prison is also extraordinarily limited. To date, only 12 out of 43 federal prisons have a "Prison Needle Exchange Program" (PNEP) and no provincial or territorial prisons in Canada distribute sterile drug equipment. The program, which requires participants to keep their kits visible when not in use and to show the kits to correctional officers during daily visual inspections, is not in keeping with public health principles or professionally accepted standards for such programs. Most fundamentally, the PNEP violates prisoners' confidentiality without reasonable justification, and participation is contingent on the approval of both prison health staff and security staff.⁸⁴ As the Correctional Investigator has observed, "Too much of what should be an exclusively health and harm reduction program has been shaped by security concerns," leading merely a handful of individuals to enrol in the program.⁸⁵ The Correctional Investigator consequently

⁷⁹ UNODC, ILO, UNDP, WHO and UNAIDS, *Policy brief: HIV prevention, treatment and care in prisons and other closed settings: a comprehensive package of interventions*, 2013; OHCHR and UNAIDS, *International Guidelines on HIV/AIDS and Human Rights*, Consolidated Version, UN Doc HR/PUB/06/9, 2006, Guideline 4, para. 21(e); UN Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment Manfred Nowak*, UN Doc A/HRC/10/44, January 14, 2009, para. 74; UN Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment Juan E. Méndez*, UN Doc A/HRC/22/53, February 1, 2013.

⁸⁰ CEDAW Committee Concluding observations, supra.

⁸¹ WHO, *Guidelines for the Psychosocially Assisted Pharmacological Treatment of Opioid Dependence*, 2009. ⁸² C. Bodkin, M. Bonn and S. Wildman, "Fuelling a crisis: Lack of treatment for opioid use in Canada's prisons and jails," *The Conversation*, March 4, 2020.

 ⁸³ F. Kouyoumdjian et al., "Physician prescribing of opioid agonist treatments in provincial correctional facilities in Ontario, Canada: A survey," *PLoS One* 2018; 13(2): e0192431 and West Coast Prison Justice Society,
"Representative human rights complaint against Correctional Service Canada (CSC) on behalf of federal prisoners with opioid use disorder," June 4, 2018.

 ⁸⁴ HIV Legal Network, *Points of Perspective: Research Report on the Federal Prison Needle Exchange Program in Canada*, 2022; A. De Shalit et al, "Drug Use Stigma and Reprisal: Barriers to Prison Needle Exchange in Canada," *The Prison Journal* 104(3) (2024): 344-364; and N. Kronfli et al, "Using nominal group technique to identify perceived barriers and facilitators to improving uptake of the Prison Needle Exchange Program in Canadian federal prisons by correctional officers and healthcare workers," *International Journal of Drug Policy* 130 (2024) 104540.
⁸⁵ Office of the Correctional Investigator, *Annual report 2018-2019*, 2019.

recommended that program criteria be "significantly revamped to encourage participation ... with a view to full national implementation."⁸⁶

38. With respect to overdose prevention, SCS currently operate in four federal prisons, where prisoners can access sterile equipment to consume drugs; no such services exist in provincial or territorial prisons. Naloxone, a medication used to reverse opioid overdoses, is available without prescription in the community, but is only accessible to prison staff. Incarcerated individuals do not have direct access to naloxone in any jurisdiction, requiring those who witness an overdose to alert staff, thus causing a delay in response.⁸⁷ Only one province (Nova Scotia) permits individuals on safer supply (prescribed alternatives to toxic unregulated drugs) in the community to maintain their safer supply prescriptions in prisons. As Canada's Correctional Investigator noted in 2023, "That there is a need for more access to a wider range of harm reduction measures behind bars now seems beyond doubt or dispute."⁸⁸

In meaningful consultation with prisoner groups, Indigenous organizations, and community health organizations, CANADA MUST:

- Expand evidence-based alternatives to incarceration for people who use drugs, taking into account the need for gender-sensitive and culturally appropriate care for women and gender-diverse people;
- Implement or remove barriers to key health and harm reduction measures in all prisons and other places of detention, including:
 - needle and syringe programs
 - opioid agonist therapy
 - condoms and other safer sex supplies
 - o programs to address tattooing, piercing, and other forms of skin penetration
 - overdose prevention services
 - safer supply

and ensuring such programs are culturally appropriate and gender-specific;

- Expand care, treatment, and support services in prison for women living with and vulnerable to HIV and HCV, including peer health programs, and ensure such support is gender-sensitive and culturally appropriate; and
- Update all federal, provincial, and territorial prison drug strategies to reject stigmatizing "zero tolerance" approaches to drug use in favour of rights-based, evidence-informed harm reduction principles and practices.

⁸⁶ Office of the Correctional Investigator, *Annual Report 2021-2022*, June 30, 2022.

⁸⁷ See, for example, S. Taylor, "Correctional Service Canada expands take-home naloxone kit program for inmates," *CBC*, July 13, 2017.

⁸⁸ Annual Report 2021-2022, supra.